

Materials Selection Compliance Rubric

This rubric is designed to assess whether a proposed work aligns with the BCLD Materials Selection and Withdrawal Policy (2019). It is for use by library administration, or designated staff, or review committees to determine inclusion of materials in the collection.

Reviewer Documentation

Reviewer Name / Position: Perry Stokes, BCLD Library Director

Date of Review: 10/16/2025

Work Title & Author: The Time Museum (Time Museum #1) by Loux, Matthew

Format (Print / Digital / AV / Other): Print

Collection Area (Adult / Teen / Juvenile / Local Interest): Juvenile Graphic Novel

Selection Criteria

- Audience for Material
- Authority / Credibility
- Budget Feasibility
- Community Relevance
- Current or Historical Significance
- Diversity of Viewpoint
- Effective Expression
- Level of Demand / Public Interest
- Media / Format Quality
- Timeliness

Scoring and Recommendation Guide

Average Score	Evaluation Outcome	Recommendation
4.5–5.0	Excellent	Strongly meets standards, merits inclusion
3.5–4.4	Good	Include if budget allows
2.5–3.4	Fair	Include if supporting broader collection goals
1.5–2.4	Weak	Consider resource sharing or defer
1.0–1.4	Poor	Does not meet policy standards
0.0–0.9	Unacceptable	Violates policy standards

Materials Selection Compliance Rubric

Selection Criteria Scores & Notes

Criterion	Description	Rating (1-5)	Notes
Audience for Material	Is the work as a whole appropriate for the intended age group or audience?	4	Target age group: 10-14 Peer libraries shelving location: Juv / Jr Graphic
Authority / Credibility	Is the author, creator, or publisher reputable or of historical significance?	5	Several works by Loux cited in Wilson's Core Graphics Collection.
Budget Feasibility	Is the cost reasonable within the current collection plan?	5	Ingram \$10.36
Community Relevance	Does it reflect or serve the interests, needs, or demographics of the Baker County community?	4	Educational – adventure story promotes academic achievement, teamwork, cultural awareness of natural and fine art history, humanities, science vocabulary and concepts, plus opportunity to discuss behavioral expectations when visiting museums. Features sculptures by Rodin, some of which are at Oregon's Maryhill Museum.
Current or Historical Significance	Is the subject of recognized importance, or the item a matter of cultural notoriety, either currently or historically?	5	2023 national news report of Florida principal forced to resign after showing image of Michelangelo's David statue to sixth graders
Diversity of Viewpoint	Does it represent a variety of perspectives, strengthen, or add balance to the collection?	4	Subject matter uncommon in graphic novel format
Effective Expression	Is the material as a whole clearly written, well-structured, and engaging for its audience? Is it recognized with positive reviews and awards?	4	Starred review from Kirkus Maverick list Panda Book Award winner of 2018 Nominated for RI Children's Book Award
Level of Demand / Public Interest	Does circulation data (historical & recent), patron request, community feedback, or industry sales data indicate strong interest?	5	Baker copy circ / timeline: 10 since 7/21 Peer Sage library counts: 19 (8/17), 29 (8/19) #47 in Amazon YA Action & Adventure Graphic Novels List
Media / Format Quality	Is production technically sound and durable?	4	Paperback copy folio bundles are loose, but sewn in.
Timeliness	Is the information up-to-date, or of enduring value if historical?	4	2023 national news report of Florida principal forced to resign after showing image of Michelangelo's David statue to sixth graders
TOTAL SCORE (xx/50)		44	

Materials Selection Compliance Rubric

Total Scoring & Recommendation: 44 / 50

Average Score	Evaluation Outcome	Recommendation
41-50	Excellent	Strongly merits inclusion
31-40	Good	Include if budget allows
21-30	Fair	Include if supporting broader collection goals
11-20	Weak	Consider resource sharing or defer
0-10	Poor	Does not meet policy standards

Miller Test for Obscenity: No

Criteria	Yes/No
The average person applying contemporary community standards would find the work, <i>taken as a whole</i> , appeals to the prurient interest.	N
The work depicts or describes, in a patently offensive way, sexual conduct specifically defined by the applicable state law.	N
The work, <i>taken as a whole</i> , lacks serious literary, artistic, political or scientific value.	N

*Unanimous Yes appraisals required to potentially reach legal obscenity designation.

Any No vote means the work is unlikely to meet the legal standard for obscenity, and therefore has First Amendment protection.

Guiding Notes for Evaluators

- The **presence of offensive or explicit content alone is not grounds for exclusion.**
- Evaluations must focus on **merit, purpose, and context of the work as a whole**, not personal moral values, or political disagreement.
- Decisions must remain consistent with BCLD's commitment to building **popular, quality, wide-ranging collections without bias.**

Materials Selection Compliance Rubric

Additional Notes and relevant information

Materials Selection Policy		Notes:
Popular demand	YES	Baker copy circ / timeline: 10 since 7/21 Peer Sage library counts: 19 (8/17), 29 (8/19)
Viewpoint or Subject Diversity	YES	Juvenile Graphic novels include few works about museums.
Acclaimed author or work	YES	Starred review from Kirkus Included on 2018 Texas Library Association's prestigious Maverick list Panda Book Award winner of 2018 Nominated for RI Children's Book Award Other works by Loux cited in Wilson's Core Graphics Collection.
Suited to Age / Shelved in collection for intended audience	YES	Target age group: 10-14 Peer libraries shelving location: Juv / Jr Graphic

Obscene (Miller, Pico)	
Work as a whole...	NO
Lacks literary, educational, artistic, political, or scientific value	NO
Includes explicit sexual or excretory content in a patently offensive way (Not contextually relevant to author's purpose or literary merit)	NO
Includes content intended to appeal to prurient interest only (As determined by average person, applying contemporary community standards)	NO
Pervasively vulgar (Pico)	NO

Pg. 53 – image rendering of **Artemision Bronze** (AKA **God from the Sea**), an ancient Greek sculpture believed to be Zeus or Poseidon. Currently in National Archaeological Museum of Athens.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Artemision_Bronze



Pg. 179 – image resembles notable sculptures from 19th-20th c.
Toilette de Venus (1890) -- also known as “The Bather” and “Awakening”

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/File:Toilette_de_Venus,_Rodin.JPG

<https://www.visitpham.org/objects/101815>

<https://www.ancientsculpturegallery.com/auguste-rodin-the-bather-sculpture.html/>



Femme à genoux (Le réveil) by Rembrandt Bugatti (1907)

<https://www.sothebys.com/en/buy/auction/2022/modern-contemporary-day-auction/femme-a-genoux-le-reveil>